Forces of Change

“Education and training that can be qualified and quantified is the currency for mobility of health care professionals and the standards upon which health care institutions employ and sustain their workforce.”

People on the Move

Why do people move?
- For education
- For work
- For safety
- For freedom
- For better quality of life
- For family reunification
- For pursuing ideologies, dreams and lifestyles
People on the Move

Concepts associated with global mobility:
- Destination countries
- Source countries
- Portability of education and credentials
- Worth of job titles
- Degree equivalency
- Registration/licensure
- Credential Evaluation

Globalization

Globalization is the international movement of technology, ideas, products, labor markets and professional education and standards.

- Transcends all boundaries
- Involves transmigration
- Erases perceived variances
- Ignores local prescriptions
- Seeps through porous borders
- Is more complex than first imagined
- Is more than internationalism
- Is irreversible
“Migration is one of the defining issues of the twenty-first century. It is now an essential, inevitable and potentially beneficial component of the economic and social life of every country and region.”

(Brunson McKinley, Director General, International Organization for Migration)

Globally Mobile Populations

- Nearly one billion people cross international borders annually
- Predicted to increase to 1.5 billion per year in 10 years
- One of every 33 individuals worldwide is a migrant
- 232 million migrants worldwide

Globally Mobile Populations

- Immigrants
- Refugees
- Migrant Workers
- International Adoptees
- Trafficking Victims
- Internal Migrants
- Displaced Persons
- Tourist and Medical Tourists
- Business Travelers
Global Migration

- 232 million worldwide; 52% women
- Countries with high amount of migrants:
  - Saudi Arabia (9.1 million)
  - United Emirates and United Kingdom (7.8 million)
  - France (7.4 million)
  - Canada (7.3 million)
  - Australia (6.5 million)
  - Spain (6.5 million)

Global Migration: Impact

Global Mobility:
- Brings new cultural dynamics and influence
- Expands our view about health and care
- Stops health care providers from conceptualizing “disease over there or disease seen here”
- Contributes to both destination and source countries
- Develops health professionals and improves job satisfaction

Global Health Worker Shortage

Globally, the World Health Organization (WHO) estimates a shortage of almost 12.9 million healthcare workers by 2035 as a result of decades of underinvestment in health worker education, training, wages, working environment and management.
Global Nursing Shortage

- Nursing shortage: the demand for nursing professionals exceeds the supply, either locally, nationally or globally
- Measured by: nurse-to-patient ratio, nurse-to-population ratio, or job openings exceeding the number of nurses working/available
- Affects developed and developing nations around the world

Global Nurse Migration

- Global mobility is expanding in full force. How do we address issues of “differences” in education and practice between and among countries to ensure safe delivery of care?
- Is the historic approach in credential evaluation to determine equivalency in education sufficient in assessing entry-to-practice readiness?

History of Credential Evaluation

- WWII: U.S. became biggest educational destination in the world
- U.S. received a continuous influx of international students
- Diversity of applicants and education systems called for a common approach in evaluating credentials
History of Credential Evaluation

- Credential evaluation - engine to fuel global mobility and migration
- Language proficiency - a significant factor in movement of people across borders
- TOEFL (Test of English as a Foreign Language) was created in 1964

Credential Evaluation Types

- Types:
  - General Statement
  - Course-by-Course
- Purposes:
  - Academic Admissions (Primary purpose)
  - Immigration
  - Employment
  - Registration/Licensure

Credential Evaluation Trends

- Educational comparability vs equivalency
- Determinative assessment based on standards vs advisory assessment
- Fraud detection
- Customized credentials evaluation reports
- Competency based assessment
Credential Evaluation Models

- Input-based versus output-based
- Quantitative versus qualitative
- Non-source versus primary source
- Verification versus validation
- Government approval versus accreditation
- Determinative versus advisory
- Equivalency versus comparability

Credential Evaluation Concepts

ILO Study: A Vision & A Reality

The International Labour Organization (ILO) commissioned CGFNS International, Inc. to conduct a comparative study on nursing competency and equivalency standards between the Philippines and Norway, Denmark, and Finland.
ILO Study: A Vision & A Reality

The study was further augmented by adding India (Kerala) and its comparison with Norway to the research. This study took place from 2012 to 2015 and offers a vision for evaluation for global mobility purposes.

ILO Project Overview

- Part of ILO Decent Work Across Borders (DWAB): A Pilot Project for Migrant Health Professionals and Skilled Workers
- Migration within a rights-based framework for labor migration management

ILO Project Overview

- Migration impacts health-related MDGs achievement
- Increasing shortage of skilled nursing workforce in EU
- Migration integral to nursing workforce planning
**Research Design**

Pair of countries:
- Philippines and Norway
- Philippines and Denmark
- Philippines and Finland
- India (Kerala) and Norway

Variables studied: Education, Regulation, Accreditation, and Practice in a matrix format

---

**Research Questions**

- What are the similarities and differences in education, accreditation, regulation and practice among the paired countries of interest:
  - Philippines - Norway
  - Philippines - Denmark
  - Philippines - Finland
  - India (Kerala) - Norway

---

**Research Questions**

- How are credentials evaluated?
- What standards/processes are used?
- What is the process for entry into the country - visa, work permit, credentials evaluation and time frames?
- How is initial nursing competence and continuing competence measured?
Research Questions

- What programs and services are in place to assist with transition to practice in the destination countries?
- What are the major challenges for migrating nurses in those countries?
- What are the nursing employment and educational trends, issues and challenges?

*Note: The Philippines & Norway Pairing will be used as a prototype for this presentation*

Developing Country Profiles

Desk Reviews
- Created and validated country profiles based on the methodological framework, for nursing regulation, accreditation, and outcomes in education and practice
- Analyzed resources from the CGFNS education database

Developing Country Profile

Validation
- Consulted with International Center on Nurse Migration (ICNM) Strategic Advisory Group
- Invited nurse consultants with expertise in nursing regulation, accreditation and outcomes in education, and practice, to validate country profiles
Conducting Field Missions

Focus Group Sessions
• Critical stakeholders to address issues emanating from methodological framework

Key Informant Interviews
• Participants selected based on their area of expertise relevant to the project
• CGFNS visited nursing programs, regulatory bodies, nursing associations, governmental ministries, trade unions, and embassies

Convergence: Norway/Philippines

• Nursing curriculum contains theory and related clinical experiences
• Similarities in entry-to-practice nursing competencies
• Entry into nursing practice at the baccalaureate level
• Regulatory practices
  ➢ Standards for entry into practice
  ➢ BSN leads to authorization to practice

Divergence: Norway/Philippines

• Curriculum
  ➢ Philippines: specific coursework in nursing leadership and management, nutrition and diet therapy, health education, pharmacology, and nursing research
  ➢ Norway: concepts are integrated throughout the curriculum. A specific research course also is required
Divergence: Norway/Philippines

- Combined primary and secondary school education: Philippines, 10 years vs. Norway, 13 years
- Length of time and number of credit hours for the baccalaureate programs vary between countries

Nursing curriculum: theoretical differences

- Philippines: first 2 years of the program focuses on general education, including humanities and languages with basic nursing courses
- Norway: general education is limited to required courses in natural and biological sciences, social sciences and health policy with no electives
- Norway requires a bachelor’s thesis for graduation. The Philippines does not
Divergence: Norway/Philippines

- Greater focus on evidence-based practice and preparation of independent thinking and reflective practice in Norwegian curriculum
- Licensing examination required for Filipino nursing graduates; licensing examination not required of Norwegian nursing graduates

Seven Policy Recommendations

- Comparability of Education
- Transparency in Comparability Determination of Educational Credentials
- Nurses as Independent Thinkers and Key Collaborators in a Healthcare Team
- Language, Culture and Social Adaptation

Seven Policy Recommendations

- Repository for Data Collection and Mining
- Longitudinal Studies
- Effective communication of education content and outcomes
The Bologna Accord

- The Bologna Process is a series of ministerial meetings and agreements between European countries designed to ensure comparability in the standards and quality of higher education qualifications.
- Education Ministers from 29 European countries signed the Bologna declaration in 1999.

The Bologna Accord

- The process has created the European Higher Education Area, in which students and graduates could move freely between countries, using prior qualifications in country as acceptable entry requirement for further study in another

The Bologna Accord

- The main focus of the Bologna Process:
  - The introduction of the three cycle system (bachelor/master/doctorate)
  - Strengthened quality assurance
  - Easier recognition of qualifications and periods of study
The Bologna Accord

• The Bologna process currently has 47 participating countries and 49 signatories

Further Analysis: Qualifications Frameworks

Goal: To analyze further to determine comparability of education
Mechanism: Using Qualifications Framework - EQF, NQF, PQF
• # of Levels: 8
• Bachelor Level: 6
• Core Purpose: Learning outcomes
• Domains: Knowledge, skills, competence

European, Norwegian, Philippines

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>EQF</th>
<th>NQF</th>
<th>PQF</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of Levels</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor Level</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Core Purpose</td>
<td>Description of learning outcomes</td>
<td>Description of learning outcomes</td>
<td>Description of learning outcomes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
European, Norwegian, Philippines

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EQF</th>
<th>NQF</th>
<th>PQF</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Domains</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge</td>
<td>Knowledge</td>
<td>Knowledge, Skills and Values</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skills</td>
<td>Skills</td>
<td>Application</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competence</td>
<td>General</td>
<td>Degree of Independence</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Definition of Knowledge: Level 6**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EQF</th>
<th>NQF</th>
<th>PQF</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Advanced knowledge of the field of work or study, involving a critical understanding of theories and principles</td>
<td>Broad knowledge of important topics, theories, issues, processes, tools and methods within the academic field</td>
<td>Broad and coherent knowledge and skills in their respective fields of study for professional/creative work, innovations and lifelong learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Familiarity with research and development work in the field</td>
<td>Ability to update his/her knowledge in the field</td>
<td>Knowledge of the history, traditions, distinctive character and place in society of the academic field</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Definition of Competence: Level 6**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EQF</th>
<th>NQF</th>
<th>PQF</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Manage complex technical or professional activities or projects, taking responsibility for decision-making in unpredictable work or study contexts</td>
<td>Has insight into relevant academic and professional ethical issues</td>
<td>Some (substantial) degree of independence and/or in teams of related fields with minimal supervision</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Definition of Competence: Level 6**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EQF</th>
<th>NQF</th>
<th>PQF</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Take responsibility</td>
<td>need to manage assignments and projects over time, alone or as part</td>
<td>take responsibility for managing professional development of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>for managing professional development</td>
<td>of a group, and in accordance with ethical requirements and</td>
<td>individual and groups and exchange experiences and knowledge with</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>of individuals and groups</td>
<td>principles</td>
<td>individuals with a background in the field, thereby contributing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>to the development of good practice and familiar with new thinking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>and innovation processes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**The Diploma Supplement**

- The Diploma Supplement (DS) is a document accompanying a higher education diploma, providing a standardized description of the nature, level, context, content and status of the studies completed by its holder.


- It is produced by the higher education institutions according to standards agreed by the European Commission, the Council of Europe and UNESCO.

The Diploma Supplement

- The supplement is designed as an aid to help (but not guarantee) recognition—it is not a CV or a substitute for the original qualification
- Graduates in all the countries taking part in the Bologna Process have the right to receive the Diploma Supplement automatically, free and in a major European language

Source: http://ec.europa.eu/education/tools/diploma-supplement_en.htm

Rationale for Assessment Tool

- Qualifications framework provides a useful scaffolding for analysis of the placement of education, credentials and degrees within and across education systems worldwide
- Qualification framework provides a necessary but insufficient mechanism for evaluation of comparability of education when the assessment requires content evidence from a prescribed course of study
- A tool is needed to mediate this analysis

What is CGFNS ECT?

- ECT- Education Comparability Tool
- ECT- Created by CGFNS to determine comparability of education of foreign-educated health professionals against a benchmark
- ECT- Typically comprised of four main areas:
  - Foundational Education or General Education
  - Professional Education
  - Clinical Education
  - Learning Outcomes
Applying the CGFNS ECT

Norwegian National Nursing Curriculum: The Rammeplan

- Bachelor of Science in 3-year Nursing Program
- Entrance requirement: 13 years of schooling
- 180 credits (ECTS) with 90 credits (ECTS) of clinical education
  - Foundational Education (75 credits):
    - Social Sciences (30 credits)
    - Medical and Natural Sciences (45 credits)

- Clinical Education (90 credits):
  - Medical Departments
  - Surgical Departments
  - Mental Health and Psychiatry
  - Elderly and Geriatrics
  - Home Care
  - Skills Training, Preparation, Reflection on Practice
Norwegian National Nursing Curriculum: The Rammeplan

- Professional Education (105 credits):
  - Professional and Scientific Basis (33 credits)
  - Nursing and Professional Education (72 credits)

Integrative Curriculum and Coursework

- Nursing Functions and Duties in Municipal Health Services
- Nursing Functions and Duties in Specialist Health
- Professional Component
- Communication, Collaboration and Conflict Resolution
- SPHPRA3220 NURSE FUNCTIONS
- Tasks at Home
- Sociology and Anthropology
- Ethics
- General Pathology and Pharmacology
- State and Local Government, Health and Social Policy
- SPH1001 Basic Nursing
- SPH1400 Medical Disease and Surgery
- SPH3220 Nursing of Patients in Community Health
- SPH1411 Nursing Function and Tasks of Basic Nursing
- SPH1421 Nursing Function and Tasks in Medical Practice
- SPH3920 Dissertation
Curriculum Mapping: Findings

- Norwegian National Curriculum as benchmark, mapped competencies, course descriptions and course objectives identified in Philippines National Curriculum using ECT
- Good match overall in competencies and/or course descriptions and objectives

Curriculum Mapping: Findings

- Areas to examine further include:
  - Research and placement of research in the curriculum
  - Teaching and guiding staff and students (Norwegian graduation competency)
  - Supporting colleagues in difficult professional or personal situations (Norwegian graduation competency)

Curriculum Mapping: Findings

- Sufficiency of Related Learning Experiences
- Interweaving of concepts throughout curriculum in Norway
  - Reflection on practice
  - Autonomy
  - Responsibility for own practice
- Integration of research throughout the curriculum in Norway
Policy Implications

In a comparative context, consider
- Integrative approaches to facilitate teaching and learning
- Learning scenarios, case studies and group projects throughout the curriculum to nurture the development of critical thinking, logical reasoning and teamwork
- Reflective practice throughout the curriculum

In Conclusion

- Confirmation of sovereign right of a country to educate nurses according to the needs of that country
- Diversity in nursing program is a natural outgrowth of addressing local needs

In Conclusion

- If nurses wish to migrate to another country to work, it is important to meet the requirements of the destination country
- To further validate the findings of this research, we will continue to work with nursing faculty in both countries
Reflections on Learning

- The need for fair and effective regulatory practices for applicants educated outside the jurisdiction
- The need for an effective assessment tool to capture the content of the required analysis for evidence-based decision-making that traditional equivalency credential evaluation models cannot support
- The need to differentiate elements/concepts that are critical from those that are important for entry-to-practice purposes

Speaker Contact Information

- Franklin A. Shaffer, EdD, RN, FAAN
  Chief Executive Officer
  fshaffer@cgfns.org
- Julia To Dutka, EdD
  Strategist
  jtodutka@cgfns.org